

Anna Sasaki

Dr. Eijun Senaha

Scholar and Scholarship II

February 2019

An Annotated Bibliography:
Marriage, Love Relationship and Gender in *Wuthering Heights*

Introduction

This annotated bibliography is a collection of references which refer to marriage, gender and/or sexuality in *Wuthering Heights*. The aim of this project is to consider the relationship among Catherine Earnshaw, Heathcliff and Edger Linton. Historical books on marriage and women in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries are included in this annotated bibliography for socio-cultural approach to the novel. This annotated bibliography adopts chronological order to follow the change of tone of argument about *Wuthering Heights*. The collection contains study from 1848, where *Wuthering Heights* published.

The incipient reviews often show puzzlement about its violence and extraordinariness. There have been little review and critique which refer marriage, love, or gender in the novel to the early twentieth century. Particularly, there were often longtime blank period in the

nineteenth century, for *Wuthering Heights* was underestimated at that time due to its complicated structure of narrative and Heathcliff's rebellious character. However, in the early twentieth century, some researches focus on the relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff in relation to the issue of incest, class, and race. Through Catherine and Heathcliff's antisocial nature, they often argue that *Wuthering Heights* throws doubt on the problems in normative society in Victorian England. On the other hand, they were apt to overlook or belittle the significance of Edger. From the 1960s on, which overlapped the second wave feminism, some researches argue Catherine's desire oppressed by social code. Some of them point out that Catherine wants to both marry Edger and maintain relationship to Heathcliff and Catherine's death results from repression by a social code which never permits Catherine's incompatible desire. Catherine's rebellious nature is regarded as Emily Brontë's objection against gender roles. The study of *Wuthering Heights* has proved that the love triangle among Catherine, Heathcliff, and Edger proposes the practice of love free from the obsession with gender roles and monogamous normativity.

List of abbreviations

WH = *Wuthering Heights* (the title of the novel)

EB = Emily Brontë

MLA = Modern Language Association of America

PMLA = *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*

ATEBWH = *Approaches to Teaching Emily Brontë's Wuthering Heights*

Bibliographies

History

- [1] Davidoff, Leonore and Catherine Hall. *Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class 1780-1850*. Hutchinson Education, 1987.

The authors mainly explain family culture of the middle class in England during 1780 to 1850; roles in family, education by gender, sexual division, etc. Women played a role to take care of their family through the lives. Marriage was an economically essential event for women of the middle class because they hadn't inheritance rights or property rights. There were some women in 1830s who desired/chose enjoying single life rather than obliged marriage for financial reason. The authors refer local examples although there was no Yorkshire where EB was born and *WH* has its setting.

- [2] Stone, Laurence. *Road to Divorce: England 1530-1987*. Oxford UP, 1990.

Stone describes the history of marriage system and marriage as a social custom. Stone explains that there were only lax and ambiguous prescriptions of marriage in England until 1753 while it was hard to accept separation and divorce before 1857. One places great importance on affective bound in choosing marriage partner during 1660 to 1800.

- [3] Stretton, Tim and Krista J. Kesselring, editors. *Married Women and the Law: Coverture in England and the Common Law World*. McGill-Queen's UP, 2013.

A collection of historical research about coverture and relevant laws in England in the seventeenth through the nineteenth centuries. This book states in details how marriage and law limited women's rights physically, mentally and socially. Married women were required to think themselves inferior to their husbands who were allowed to possess wives' property and freedom of body. Wives had to obey husbands and take care of children. Women were restricted.

Study of *WH*

1847

Not found

1848

- [4] "Douglas Jerrold's Weekly Newspaper." 15 Jan. 1848. *Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights*, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 43-44.

This review comments that *WH* is "a strange sort of book" because of its unidentifiable power. This review criticizes cruelty and inhumanity but admires the demonic power of love in *WH*. It guarantees that *WH* is a peerless novel.

[5] “An Unidentified Review of 1847-8.” Reproduced, from the cutting preserved at Hawort Parsonage Museum by Charles Simpson in his *Emily Brontë*, 1929. *Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights*, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 47-48.

This review admires the quality of *WH* and *EB*'s uncommon talent. It introduces *WH* as a domestic novel which contains mysterious characters, their strange relationships and their life events such as marriage in desolate house.

1849

Not found

1850

[6] Dobell, Sidney. “Curren Bell.” *Palladium*, 1850. *Life and Letters of Sydney Dobell*, edited by E. Jolly, 1878. *Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights*, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 59-62.

Dobell points out that two simultaneous loves coexist in Catherine's mind. Dobell argues that Catherine's two passions are respectively due to the two elements in her mind, although Dobell does not state clearly any more.

[7] Lewes, G.H.. “Sombre, Rude, Brutal, yet True.” *Leader*, 28 Dec 1850. *Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights*, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 68-69.

Lewes analyzes Catherine's love for Heathcliff. Lewes argues that Catherine loves more Heathcliff than Edger, even if she is ashamed of Heathcliff when she comes to be close to the Linton. Edger loves Catherine with his cultured goodness, but Heathcliff's passion surpasses at Edger.

1851-56

Not found

1857

[8] Montégut, Émile. "A Dark Poetic Imagination." Translated from *Charlotte Brontë, IV: Les Œuvres*, 1857. *Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights*, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 79-80.

Montégut analyzes Catherine's affection for Heathcliff. According to Montégut, Catherine regards Heathcliff as the source of her energies. She will obtain two sexes, identities, and souls with Heathcliff. Compared with Heathcliff, Edger has too weak spirit for Catherine.

1858-72

Not found

1873

[9] "The Life and Wirings of Emily Brontë" *Galaxy*, vol, 15, 1873.

Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 85-86.

This review expresses Heathcliff's passion for Catherine as "soul for soul." It indicates that their relationship is not sexual, for the review points out that EB's work contains "childlike simplicity and innocence."

1874-1923

Not found

1924

[10] Abercrombie, Lascelles. "The Unquestionable Supremacy of Emily." *Brontë Society Transactions*, 1924. *Emily Brontë: Wuthering Heights*, edited by Miriam Allott, Macmillan, 1970, pp. 118-21.

Abercrombie proposes that love is the coherent purpose of *WH*. Abercrombie states that EB's poem, "The Prisoner," gives a clue to understand Catherine and Heathcliff's eternal passion of love, although Abercrombie does not clarify the answer.

1925-33

Not found

1934

[11] Cecil, David. "Emily Brontë and 'Wuthering Heights.'" *Early*

Victorian Novelists: Essays in Revaluation, 1934. Penguin Books, 1948, pp.115-51.

A collection of essay about Victorian novels and novelists in England. Cecil proposes “storm” and “calm” concept which EB’s universe comprises and explains that Catherine loves Heathcliff because they have same nature of “storm”. Cecil concludes that Catherine’s love for Heathcliff is, therefore, sexless. Cecil also regards that it is only Heathcliff, not Edger, who accomplishes to combine with Catherine after his death.

1935-47

Not found

1948

[12] Chase, Richard. “The Brontës, or, Myth Domesticated.” *Forms of Modern Fiction*, edited by William van O’connor, The U of Minnesota P, 1948, pp. 102-19.

Chase argues that the Brontë sisters brought up under patriarchy and their novel describes women who are ill with neuroses due to a male-oriented society. Chase states that Catherine cannot enunciate the reason why she rejects Heathcliff in spite of her mission to marry him. Heathcliff and Edger suffer from Catherine’s immorality.

1949-57

Not found

1958

[13] Visick, Mary. *The Genesis of Wuthering Heights*. Oxford UP, 1958.

In this book, Visick compared *WH* with EB's poetries to trace the origin of *WH*'s idea. Visick points out that Catherine's love for Edger which is compared to mortal trees is an ordinary sexual love while Catherine and Heathcliff transcend general sexual or romantic love. *WH* is a tragedy of a social world where Catherine's two types of loves cannot coexist unlike poetic world.

1959-61

Not found

1962

[14] Moser, Thomas. "What is the Matter with Emily Jane?: Conflicting Impulses in *Wuthering Heights*." *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 17, no. 1, Jun. 1962, pp. 1-19. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/2932813. Accessed 4 Aug. 2017.

Moser argues that it is Heathcliff who has masculinity most in *WH*. Moser gives an instance the fight scene of Heathcliff vs Edger in the parlor in Thrushcross Grange, which proves that Heathcliff overwhelms Edger in terms of his masculinity. Moser proposes that Heathcliff can be said, at least, a symbolical father of second Catherine, according to the time of his return after the disappearance and Catherine's pregnancy.

1963

[15] Thompson, Wade. "Infanticide and Sadism in *Wuthering Heights*."

PMLA, vol. 78, 1963, pp. 69-74.

Thompson argues that Catherine loves Heathcliff as a child while she loves Edger as an adult lover. According to Thompson, Heathcliff takes revenge by imposing adult sexual relationship upon their children and leads his son to death because being child hinders consummation of love between Catherine and Heathcliff.

1964-67

Not found

1968

[16] Guérard, Albert. "Preface to *Wuthering Heights*." *Twentieth*

Century Interpretations of Wuthering Heights: A Collection of Critical Essays, edited by Thomas A. Vogler, Prentice Hall, 1968, pp. 63-68.

Guérard expresses the relationship Catherine desires for Heathcliff and Edger "ménage-à-trois"; according to Guérard, Catherine wants and needs both Edger, who has social companionship, and Heathcliff, who is more masculine and has more sexual energy than Edger. Guérard argues that Catherine oddly seems to take it for granted that the ménage à trois could maintain and she "elects to die" because neither men accept it.

1969

[17] Leavis, Q. D.. "A Fresh Approach to *Wuthering Heights*." 1969.

Wuthering Heights: Emily Brontë, edited by Patsy Stoneman,
Macmillan, 1993, pp. 24-38.

Leavis regards Heathcliff as an illegitimate son of Mr. Earnshaw. Leavis thinks that Catherine loves not Heathcliff but Edger Linton in a sexual way because she is half-blood sister of Heathcliff. Leavis points out that child's native goodness is corrupted by society in *WH*.

1970-71

Not found

1972

[18] Williams, Gordon. "The Problem of Passion in *Wuthering Heights*."

Trivium, vol.7, 1972, pp. 41-53.

Williams points out that *WH* is concerned with women problem of Victorian society although the setting of the story is pre-Victorian era. According to Williams, Catherine proposes ménage à trois because she needs both Heathcliff and Edger. However, Catherine's nature and desire are too abnormal to have the sanction of the society.

1973

Not found

1974

- [19] Sucksmith, Harvey P.. "The Theme of *Wuthering Heights* Reconsidered." *The Dalhousie Review*, vol. 54, 1974, pp. 418-28.

Sucksmith analyzes Catherine's respective relationships between Edger and Heathcliff. Sucksmith agrees that the former is simply sexual relationship because there is a suggestion of Catherine's active sexual life by her pregnancy in *WH*; the latter is mystical rather than sexual, for Catherine and Heathcliff compare themselves to impersonal elements when they identify with each other. Sucksmith guesses that EB rebels against Victorian virtues by writing the primitive connection between Catherine and Heathcliff.

1975

Not found

1976

- [20] Eagleton, Terry. "Myths of the Power." 1976. *Wuthering Heights: Emily Brontë*, edited by Patsy Stoneman, Macmillan, 1993, pp. 118-30.

Eagleton discusses the novel from Marxian view. Eagleton explains that nature of the relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff is "pre-social" or "non-social"; they can preserve it by refusing any social thing and remaining themselves savage. Thus their love accomplish in the other world, extremely out of society.

[21] Hinz, Evelyn J.. "Hierogamy versus Wedlock: Types of Marriage Plots and Their Relationship to Genres of Prose Fiction." *PMLA*, vol. 91, no. 5. 1976, pp. 900-13.

Hinz discusses patterns of marriage plot in literature. According to Hinz, by illustrating "wedlock" marriage, which has pejorative connotation, EB mocks unrealistic comic marriage plots often found in other novels. Taking *WH* as an appropriate example, Hinz states that typical wedlock novel often ended in "hierogamous" union as a relief, opposite to secular and legal marriage. Hinz also suggests that sacred marriage is not just union of man and woman but also conjunction of the elements.

1977-78

Not found

1979

[22] Gilbert, Sandra and Susan Guber. "Looking Oppositely: Emily Brontë's Bible of Hell." *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination*, Yale UP, 1979, pp. 248-308.

It is referred that the number of three is observed in fairytales. Gilbert and Guber argue that (1) Heathcliff is substitute of a whip Catherine wants, and Catherine becomes androgynous by uniting Heathcliff, and becomes rebellious against patriarchy. (2) The

relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff is “devoid of sexual” like Adam and Eve before they lose the paradise. (3) In the novel, sex brings death to women. (Frances and Catherine) (4) The scene that Catherine is bitten by a dog of the Lintons indicates sexual meanings.

1980-81

Not found

1982

[23] Goetz, William R. “Genealogy and Incest in *Wuthering Heights*.” *Studies in the Novel*, vol. 14, no.4, 1982, pp. 359-76.

Goetz argues the correspondence between two generations in *WH* from analogy of names and symmetrical family trees. Goetz focuses on marriage and incest in the novel. Incest applies to the relationship between Heathcliff and Catherine, based on C. Lévi-Strauss’ idea that Heathcliff is an illegitimate child of Mr. Earnshaw. Goetz insists that Catherine is fond Heathcliff due to their likeness as siblings and Edger Linton is an only person Catherine should marry in exogamous system. In *WH*, endogamous marriage is conclusively accepted by second Catherine’s cousin marriage which is more reconciliatory than Catherine and Heathcliff’s sibling incest.

1983

[24] Chitham, Edward. *Brontë facts and Brontë problems*. Macmillan, 1983.

A collection of essays on the Brontës by Chitham and Tom Winnifrith. They peruse the value of the Brontës' works in light of existing biographical information. This book is helpful to study EB's chronology and analysis of EB's thought. They especially argue *WH* in ch. 3, 4,5,6,8 and 10.

[25] Chitham, Edward. "Emily Brontë and Shelley." *Brontë facts and Brontë problems*, Macmillan, 1983.

Chitham points out a possibility that EB had been influenced by Shelley's rejection of monogamy. According to Chitham, there are some common features to Shelley's love for Emilia in *Epipsychidion* and Catherine's love for Heathcliff in *WH*. Chitham also explains that Catherine loves both Edger and Heathcliff and, therefore, Catherine would not be satisfied if ever she chose Heathcliff only.

[26] Davies, Stevie. *Emily Brontë: The Artist as a Free Woman*. Carcanet P, 1983.

An analysis of EB from biography, poetry and the novel. In ch. 6, Davies analyzes Catherine's "baby-work" to destroy her pillow. Catherine's soul as a female seeks a lost male counterpart after she has betrayed Heathcliff. But sexual union is not the subject of the novel. It is rather metaphysical and 'human' search. In ch. 8, Davies focuses on threefold relationship – Edger, Catherine, Heathcliff. Davies analyzes the Lintons is feminine and the Earnshaws including Heathcliff is masculine. Thus Edger and Heathcliff are "two halves of a single mind."

Davies states EB has idea it is not necessary to be bound traditional gender role.

1984

Not found

1985

[27] Gold, Linda. "Catherine Earnshaw: Mother & Daughter." *English Journal*, vol. 74, no. 3, 1985, pp. 68-73.

Gold considers the bond among Catherine, Heathcliff and Edger Linton applying to Freud theory. For Catherine (ego), nature of Heathcliff (id) is basis for the personality but she needs both two men (Edger corresponds to superego) because these three conceptions are oneness. Gold also refers that ego which faces to world must be male, so Catherine (ego) confronts "her lack of power and freedom in this male world", too.

[28] Matthew, John T.. "Framing in 'Wuthering Heights.'" 1985.

Wuthering Heights: Emily Brontë, edited by Patsy Stoneman, Macmillan, 1993, pp. 54-73

Matthew points out that frame of the narrative limits the story of Catherine and Heathcliff's love within their understanding. Matthew agrees Q. D. Leaves' idea that Heathcliff and Catherine are brother and sister. Their relationship contains "unspeakable natural passion" including incest and desire to escape from "tyrannous convention",

which cannot be approved in law, society, or morality.

1986

- [29] Jacobs, N. M.. "Gender and Layered Narrative in *Wuthering Heights*." 1986. *Wuthering Heights: Emily Brontë*, edited by Patsy Stoneman, Macmillan, 1993, pp. 74-85.

Jacobs focuses on structure of narrative in *WH*. Jacobs describes patresfamilias' domination over both men and women legitimizes violence in the novel. Jacobs points out Catherine's "male" traits such as anger and desire surfaces with Heathcliff, and Heathcliff turns down any "feminine" or soft emotion after Catherine's death.

1987

- [30] Armstrong, Nancy. *Desire and Domestic Fiction*. Oxford UP, 1987.

This book argues the novels by women in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in England. Armstrong takes the followings as an example of female authority affecting male; Heathcliff is led to death by Catherine; Nelly Dean has knowledge worthy of a narrator more than Lockwood. Armstrong focuses on two Catherine's names shifting and female desire suppressed in sexual relationship, and concludes that *WH* is not only a fiction but also a history of sexuality.

- [31] Bloom, Harold, editor. *The Brontës*. Chelsea House Publishers, 1987.

A collection of nine essays about Charlotte, Emily and Anne

Brontës and their works. In introduction, Bloom states that Catherine and Heathcliff can consummate their love only by death because sexuality is mingled with death for EB. Bloom also says that “love” is inadequate to express the connection between Catherine and Heathcliff.

[32] Boone, Joseph Allen. *Tradition Counter Tradition: Love and the Form of Fiction*. U of Chicago P, 1987.

Boone organizes how the ideologies of love, marriage and sexual relationship have been deciphered in Anglo American fiction. In Introduction, there are descriptions of literary and critical history of love-plot. Boone states that writers gradually came to break through the traditional marriage plot in the novel from 1840s to 1930s. Boone spares one chapter to *WH*.

[33] Boone, Joseph Allen. “*Wuthering Heights: Uneasy Wedlock and Unquiet Slumbers.*” *Tradition Counter Tradition: Love and the Form of Fiction*, U of Chicago P, 1987, pp.151-72.

Boone designates *WH* a counter tradition novel which overthrows traditional marriage plot by description of negative results of male tyranny and the open end of Catherine and Heathcliff’s relationship. Boone argues that Catherine and Heathcliff are, in a symbolical way, twins who are free from boundary of conventional sexual identity. Therefore, *WH* implies not incest but a romantic attraction redefined by EB.

[34] Chitham, Edward. *A Life of Emily Brontë*. Basil Blackwell, 1987.

A biography of EB. The biography focuses on *WH* in ch. 13 through 15. Chitham states that Catherine in *WH* represents EB's particular religious thought and thanatopsis we can read from her poems too. Chitham points out EB might have a dualistic idea of sexes; in *Gondal* poem, there appear an idea that a boy and a girl are the one such as Catherine and Heathcliff. Chitham guesses the children in *Gondal* poem represent two sides of EB's nature.

1988

[35] McGuire, Kathryn B. "The Incest Taboo in *Wuthering Heights*: A Modern Appraisal." *American Imago*, vol. 45, no. 2, 1988, pp. 217-24.

McGuire argues the possibility of incest between Heathcliff and Catherine. According to McGuire, the circumstance of children at *Wuthering Heights* is applicable to cause incest. Incest is a way to unite. Ones can want spiritual unity when they forced to be separated physically. Man who commits incest tend to conflict with father, which is applied to Heathcliff's relation to Hindley who is new owner of *Wuthering Heights* and substitute of Catherin's father.

[36] Stevenson, John Allen. "'Heathcliff is Me!': *Wuthering Heights* and the Question of Likeness." *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, vol. 43 no. 1, U of California P, 1988, pp. 60-81. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/3044981. Accessed 24 May 2017.

Stevenson argues marriage and affinity. Stevenson asserts that Catherine and Heathcliff cannot explain how they are like without triangular relation among Catherine, Heathcliff and Edger, comparing how different their nature is from Linton. According to Stevenson, Edger is suitable as a marriage partner due to his state equal to Catherine while Heathcliff can be both illegitimate child and complete outsider of the Earnshaws. However, Catherine loves Heathcliff because their bond is based on internal likeness.

[37] Yaeger, Patricia. *Honey-mad Women: Emancipatory Strategies in Women's Writing*. Columbia UP, 1988.

Yaegar argues women's relation to language and speech. According to Yaeger, women have been restricted their eloquence by masculine culture. In ch. 6, the Yaeger points out that EB exposes gender and class asymmetries. In the novel, both Catherine and Heathcliff try to adjust themselves into their gender role (young lady and gentleman) in order to fill the class and gender gaps that separate them.

1989

[38] Flieger, Jerry Alice. "Entertaining the Ménage à Trois: Psychoanalysis, Feminism, and Literature." *Feminism and Psychoanalysis*, edited by Richard Feldstein and Judith Roof, Cornell UP, 1989, pp. 185-208.

Flieger states that "the number three is an awkward number as we

struggle to ‘entertain’ three complex traditions and modes of thought.” Flieger introduces Freud’s psychoanalysis and its relationship with feminist literary criticism. Flieger discusses oedipal triangle relationship. There is no mention of *WH* but this is informative source to think of love triangle relationships which appear in *WH*.

[39] Levy, Anita. “Blood, Kinship, and Gender.” *Genders*, vol. 5, 1989, pp. 70-85.

Levy argues kinship, gender, and marriage through fiction novels. Levy analyzes Catherine’s relationship to Heathcliff and Edger respectively. The former is exogamous (different race and class), and the latter is endogamous. Levy points out that marriage should bring with both kinship network and sexual desire as materials and states that Catherine’s asocial desire can result in making the nuclear family.

[40] Pykett, Lyn. *Emily Brontë*. Macmillan, 1989.

A biography on EB. This book is one of women writers serious. Therefore, Pykett especially discuss EB as a woman writer. Ch. 5, 6 and 8 picks up *WH*. Pykett indicates that Romanticism was a male-centered trend at all. EB was manly woman for her gender, and she wrote transcendence of limitations or boundaries in *WH*. Pykett argues that *WH* is a gothic novel in which express women’s terror under legal control by men. Catherine is restricted socially due to her gender in this world, however, her power overwhelms male characters such as Heathcliff and Edger, especially after her death.

1990

- [41] Barreca, Regina. "The Power of Excommunication: Sex and the Feminine Text in *Wuthering Heights*." *Sex and Death in Victorian Literature*, Macmillan Press, 1990, pp. 227-40.

Barreca argues that women language more eloquent of their desire than that of men in the novel. Barreca introduces Albert Guerard's reaction toward Catherine's ménage-à-trois desire, and Nancy Armstrong's view that EB tried to represent women's unseen desires.

- [42] Tayler, Irene. *Holy Ghost: The Male Muse of Emily and Charlotte Brontë*. Columbia UP, 1990.

A study of Charlotte and Emily Brontës. In ch. 2, Tayler focuses on *WH*. Tayler comments that EB was sure to have some male elements owing to her father and she embodies her manliness in Heathcliff's fierce natures in *WH*. Tayler analyzes the relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff; it is not just friendship nor romance; according to Tayler, for Catherine, Heathcliff is a symbol of memory, her inner self and origin while Edger is of ambition for the future.

1991-92

Not found

1993

- [43] Stoneman, Patsy, editor. *Wuthering Heights: New Casebooks*.

Macmillan, 1993.

A collection of ten essays about *WH*. In introduction, Stoneman comments upon beneficial essays besides what are printed in the book and explains how these are related to each other on the history of literary criticism.

1994

[44] Vine, Steven. "The Wuther of the Other in *Wuthering Heights*." *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, vol. 49, no. 3, U of California P, 1994, pp. 339-59. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/2933820. Accessed 24 May 2017.

Vine argues Catherine's relationship to Heathcliff associated with gender ideology. According to Vine, Catherine reflects herself in Heathcliff who is an indeterminate disposition in Heights because she is helpless in Mr. Earnshaw's paternalism as a woman. Catherine's change to a lady after five-week stay at Thrushcross Grange means loss of Heathcliff as her rebellious self in childhood for her. The first-generation tale is regarded as tragedy resulted from patriarchy.

1995

Not found

1996

[45] Goodlett, Debra. "Love and Addiction in *Wuthering Heights*." *The Midwest Quarterly*. vol. 37, no, 3, 1996, pp. 316-327.

Goodlett focuses on the relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff. Goodlett explains that there is an addictive relationship between them; Catherine depends on the gratifying experience with Heathcliff. Goodlett analyses the addictive natures of them and argues that it causes tragedy in the novel. Goodlett also points out that Catherine is reluctant to marry Edger because of her addictive bond with Heathcliff while she needs not only love but material comfort.

[46] Stoneman, Pasty. "Catherine Earnshaw's Journey to Her Home among the Dead: Fresh Thought on *Wuthering Heights* and 'Epipsychidion'." *Review of English Studies: A Quarterly Journal of English Literature and the English Language*, vol.47, no.188, 1996, pp. 521-33.

Stoneman inspects what are Catherine's loves for Heathcliff and Edger. Stoneman introduces Edward Chitham's assumption that EB obtains the triangular relationship from P. B. Shelley. Stoneman rebuts general construction that Catherine betrays Heathcliff (and her own love), and suggests that Catherine rather loves both Heathcliff and Edger simultaneously.

1997-2002

Not found

2003

[47] Lamonica, Drew. "*Wuthering Heights*: The Boundless Passion of

Catherine Earnshaw.” *We Are Three Sisters: Self and Family in the Writing of the Brontës*, University of Missouri Press, 2003, pp. 95-117.

Lamonica discusses *WH* from the point of female identity in the eighteenth and the nineteenth centuries. Female identity at that time depends on the roles of family (daughter, sister, and wife). Catherine’s identification with Heathcliff, which is incompatible in terms of class and gender, is her desire to transcend conventional female selfhood. Because he is a male, Heathcliff surmounts restraint that Catherine is forced as a female. Lamonica argues that Catherine desires to be Catherine Earnshaw-Heathcliff-Linton all at once and her tragedy is caused by incompleteness of it.

[48] Thaden, Barbara Z.. “Procrustean Bed: Gender Roles in Emily Brontë’s *Wuthering Heights* (1847).” *Women in Literature: Reading through the Lens of Gender*, edited by Jerilyn Fisher and Ellen S. Silber, Greenwood P, 2003, pp. 306-08.

Thaden supposes that Catherine dies to be free from “restrictive social bonds”. Catherine hopes to keep the “ménage à trois” with Heathcliff and Edger Linton, but social expectation imposes her to be a conventional wife and mother. Thaden calls Catherine as “androgynous child” and states that she “refused to be owned by one man”.

[49] Cory, Abbie L. “‘Out of My Brother’s Power’: Gender, Class and Rebellion in *Wuthering Heights*.” *Women’s Studies*, vol. 34, 2004, pp. 1-26. *Taylor & Francis*, doi:10.1080/00497870590903469. Accessed 27 June 2017.

Cory focuses on Young Ireland and the Chartist, and describes historical facts about women’s social status and women’s movements in the nineteenth century. Cory develops the argument into EB’s interest in a social activity, for EB’s father was from Ireland and she might know such a social movements by newspaper. Cory concludes that *WH* contains antithesis of traditional gender role and monogamous marriage.

2005

Not found

2006

[50] Heller, Tamar. “Haunted Bodies: The Female Gothic of *Wuthering Heights*.” *ATEBWH*, edited by Sue Lonoff and Terri A. Hasseler, MLA, 2006, pp. 67-74.

Heller treats gender issue in *WH*’s marriage and sexuality. According to Heller, *WH* is the female gothic which concerns women’s conflict between domestic ideology and transgressive desire like Catherine’s affection for Heathcliff. Catherine’s ghost is associated with gothic heroine who is imprisoned in house and marital position.

Heller focuses on Catherine's "liminal position" and states that Catherine's marriage just contains her passionate nature into sophisticated world. Catherine, by her own death, finally runs away from both her marital position and motherhood, which are associated with female gender ideology in the nineteenth century. Heller also states that *Wuthering Heights* is the symbolical place of marital trauma for Isabella and second Catherine. EB describes women's vulnerability to domestic violence through these marriage and imprisonment.

[51] Mardorossian, Carine M.. "Geometries of Race, Class, and Gender: Identity Crossing in *Wuthering Heights*." *ATEBWH*, edited by Sue Lonoff and Terri A. Hasseler, MLA, 2006, pp. 44-50.

Mardorossian argues that *WH* suggests crossing boundaries of existing categories such as race, class and gender. Mardorossian's main subject is difference in race between Catherine (white) and Heathcliff (presumably nonwhite) and how it exerts their relationship. Mardorossian refers that a leverage of category such as race is entangled others such class and gender.

[52] Qualls, Barry V.. "Victorian Border Crossings: Thinking about Gender in *Wuthering Heights*." *ATEBWH*, edited by Sue Lonoff and Terri A. Hasseler, MLA, 2006, pp. 51-59.

Qualls asserts that no novelists in the nineteenth century challenged gender issues as much as EB. Qualls argues that "gendered

domestic realism” suffers Catherine and Heathcliff, and gender and class issues “kill” them finally. Catherine is described as “a not character to conceived to survive the requirement [...] of Victorian domestic realism.” Qualls also refers as gender issues; the bias and different recognition caused two male and female narrators in *WH*. Marriage of second Catherine and Hareton Earnshaw is a proper answer of Englishness.

[53] Reeves, Amy Carol. “Emily Brontë’s Pedagogy of Desire in *Wuthering Heights*.” *Victorian Newsletter*, vol. 109, 2006, pp. 16-21.

Reeves focuses on women agency for male ignorance in *WH* and picks up Heathcliff- Catherine, Lockwood-Nelly, Hareton-Cathy relationship. According to Reeves, that woman teaches male pupil may imply become sexual relation. The reason why Heathcliff accomplish love for Catherine is that he ceases learning her when he ceases reading. Reeves argues that marriage of Cathy and Hareton reflects Emily Brontë’s has ideal for marriage; woman has influence and leads male partner which is unlike nineteenth-century society.

[54] Surridge, Lisa. “*Wuthering Heights*, Women, and the Law: A Historical Approach.” *ATEBWH*, edited by Sue Lonoff and Terri A. Hasseler, MLA, 2006, pp. 113-17.

Surridge introduces annotated bibliographies about contemporary marriage system and discusses how *WH* reflects historical facts.

Surridge's topic is mainly married woman's property and inheritance from father to child, taking Isabella and second Catherine as examples. Surridge indicates both Heights and Grange in *WH* symbolize women's confinement though the latter is less obviously.

2007

Not found

2008

[55] Leung, William. "Re-Reading Edgar Linton and *Wuthering Heights*." *English*, vol. 57, no. 217, 2008, pp. 4-38.

Leung construes that Edgar Linton is "the positive another counterpart of Heathcliff" and objects to Edger's negative reputation on which conventional study has often insisted. According to Leung, critics have often ignored Edger's good side with bias and prone to regard him as too patriarchal and too effeminate. Leung enumerates Edger's description in the affirmative and proposes to apply William Blake's idea of "two contrary states of the human soul" to criticize *WH*; Positive-negative dichotomy should not be applicable to Heathcliff and Edger. This essay's point is that critics had better to remain impartial to evaluate them.

2009-11

Not found

2012

[56] Caldwell, Janis McLaren. "Mental Health." *The Brontës in Context*, edited by Marianne Thormählen, Cambridge UP, 2012, pp. 344-51.

Caldwell focuses on Brontës' mental illness. This is also useful to consider Catherine's madness and delirium, for Caldwell refers that some scholars approach people and works in Victorian era in the light of modern psychiatry.

[57] Garofalo, Daniela "Impossible Love and Commodity Culture in Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights*." *Women, Love, and Commodity Culture in British Romanticism*, Ashgate, 2012, pp. 139-58.

Garofalo considers the function of Heathcliff in a capitalist culture and argues desire in *WH* compared with commodity culture. Garofalo introduces Stoneman's article which points out that Catherine offers to keep ménage à trois with Heathcliff and Edger, and suggests she demands free love against patriarchy in the nineteenth century.

[58] Matus, Jill L.. "Sexuality." *The Brontës in Context*, edited by Marianne Thormählen, Cambridge UP, 2012, pp. 328-34.

Matus refers that Brontës' works suggests that Brontë sisters had acquaintance with sexuality despite of the current of the Victorian era which repressed women's sexual desire and constrained them to be

chaste. Matus states that it is because Patrick Brontë, father of Brontë sisters, allowed them to read books widely and freely. Matus argues that the relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff is like quasi-incestuous, but it is uncertain whether or how much their passion is sexual.

[59] Thormählen, Marianne, editor. *The Brontës in Context*. Cambridge UP, 2012.

A collection of essays about the Brontës. It is composed of three parts: biographies, history of scholarship and criticism, and historical and cultural backgrounds. There are chapters about “Law” (ch. 35), “Marriage and Family Life” (ch.38) and “Sexuality” (ch.40) in the nineteenth century. To understand Catherine’s delirium in *WH*, notes of ch.42 (“Mental Health”) is useful.

[60] Thormählen, Marianne. “Marriage and Family Life.” *The Brontës in Context*, Cambridge UP, 2012, pp. 311-17.

Thormählen states that in the early nineteenth century, it is taken for granted that family loves their home and that children are educated there as the Brontës did typically, which exposes how unusual home environment Catherine and Heathcliff are when they are children in *WH*. Thormählen also refers marriage and position of married women. Women had to depend on their husbands and could not have any property, and it was impossible to divorce for women. Thormählen points out that in Brontës’ works, unmarried women and widows are

tend to be happy more than married women.

[61] Ward, Ian. "Law." *The Brontës in Context*, edited by Marianne Thormählen, Cambridge UP, 2012, pp. 290-95.

Ward mainly focuses on restriction of women's right. Married women are under coverture, which means they had no property; all of their properties even including their bodies belong to their husbands. Ward refers that there is description on settlement in *WH*.

2013-14

Not found

2015

[62] Schaffer, Talia. "Reading on the Contrary: Cousin Marriage, *Mansfield Park*, and *Wuthering Heights*." *Queer Victorian Families: Curious Relation in Literature*, edited by Duc Dau and Shale Preston, Routledge, 2015, pp.157-75.

Schaffer refers to the history of marriage considering the relations to *Mansfield Park* and *WH*. Schaffer lists up three types of marriage: cousin marriage, companionate marriage and romantic marriage. In the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, marriage was regarded as both individual contract and family/social event. According to Schaffer, two contrast types of family which are depicted in *WH* were coexisted during the most of the nineteenth century in England; the Earnshaws is a traditional family form because different people such as

foster children and servants coexist as members of their house without private space; while the Lintons is a privatized nuclear family. Schaffer applies Catherine and Isabella to Perry's argument that to leave natal family is traumatic for women. Schaffer also discusses Catherine's marriage and relations with Heathcliff and Edger. Schaffer doesn't conclude how Catherine's desires for two men are romantic, sexual, or else friendly but states at least Catherine wants both.

2016

Not found

2017

[63] Tytler, Graeme. "The Presentation of Edgar Linton in *Wuthering Heights*." *Brontë Studies*, vol. 42, no. 4, 2017, pp. 312-320.

Tytler enumerates descriptions of Edger Linton's nature and general impression for readers. Tytler also considers the relationship of Catherine and Edger. Catherine depends on Edger to show her love but she stops loving him since Heathcliff returns. Tytler hypothesizes that Catherine postpones her marriage to Edger because of wait for Heathcliff's back and that she conceives at the day of Heathcliff's return.

2018

Not found

Authors and Editors Index

A

Abercrombie, Lascelles [10]
 Allott, Miriam [4] [5] [6] [7]
 [8] [9] [10]
 Armstrong, Nancy [30]

B

Barreca, Regina [41]
 Bloom, Harold [31]
 Boone, Joseph Allen [32] [33]

C

Caldwell, Janis McLarren [56]
 Cecil, David [11]
 Chase, Richard [12]
 Chitham, Edward [24] [25]
 [34]
 Cory, Abbie L. [49]

D

Davidoff, Leonore [1]
 Davies, Stevie [26]
 Dau, Duc [62]
 Dobell, Sidney [6]

E

Eagleton, Terry [20]

F

Feldstein, Richard [38]
 Flieger, Jerry Alice [38]
 Fisher, Jerilyn [48]

G

Garofalo, Daniela [57]
 Gilbert, Sandra [22]
 Goet, William R [23]
 Gold, Linda [27]
 Goodlett, Debra [45]
 Guber, Susan [22]
 Guérard, Albert [16]

H

Hall, Catherine [1]
 Hasseler, Terri A. [50] [51]
 [52] [54]
 Heller, Tamar [50]
 Hinz, Evelyn J. [21]

I**J**

Jacobs, N. M. [29]
 Jolly, E. [6]

K

- Kesselring, Krista J. [3]
- L**
- Lamonica, Drew [47]
- Leavis, Q. D. [17]
- Leung, William [55]
- Levy, Anita [39]
- Lewes, G. H. [7]
- Lonoff, Sue [50] [51] [52]
[54]
- M**
- Mardorossian, Carine M. [51]
- Matthew, John T. [28]
- Matus, Jill L. [58]
- McGuire, Kathryn B. [35]
- Montégut, Émile [8]
- Moser, Thomas [14]
- N**
- O**
- O'connor, William van [12]
- P**
- Preston, Shale [62]
- Pykett, Lyn [40]
- Q**
- Qualls, Barry V. [52]
- R**
- Reeves, Amy Carol [53]
- Roof, Judith [38]
- S**
- Schaffer, Talia [62]
- Silber, Ellen S. [48]
- Simpson, Charles [5]
- Stevenson, John Allen [36]
- Stone, Laurence [2]
- Stoneman, Patsy [17] [28]
[29] [43] [46]
- Stretton, Tim [3]
- Sucksmith, Harvey P. [19]
- SurrIDGE, Lisa [54]
- T**
- Tayler, Irene [42]
- Thaden, Barbara Z. [48]
- Thompson, Wade [15]
- Thormählen, Marianne [56]
[58] [59] [60] [61]
- Tytler, Graeme [63]
- U**
- V**
- Vine, Steven [44]
- Visick, Mary [13]
- Vogler, Thomas A. [16]

W

Ward, Ian [61]

Williams, Gordon [18]

X

Y

Yaeger, Patricia [37]